## In reply to: THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO WESTERN DIVISION

MARJORIE FERRELL, et al.,	)
Plaintiffs,	) No. C-1-01-447
v.	) Judge Sandra S. Beckwith
WYETH-AYERST LABORATORIES, INC., et al.,	) Magistrate Judge Timothy S. Hogan
Defendants.	)

## PLAINTIFFS' REPLY BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF THEIR MOTION FOR LEAVE TO ADD ADDITIONAL SUBCLASS 1 REPRESENTATIVE

Wyeth opposes Plaintiffs' Motion for Leave on two grounds. First, Wyeth claims it will be prejudiced by having to take additional discovery from Ms. Berg. This argument has little merit because discovery has not yet commenced with regard to the remaining two representatives for Subclass 1 and because the amount of discovery required is not significant. For example, defendants previously only took a half-day deposition of plaintiffs' other consumer class representative, Marjorie Ferrell. This "burden" does not justify denying Ms. Berg the opportunity to participate in this case.

Second, Wyeth claims that Ms. Berg should not be permitted to participate because there are already two other representatives for Subclass 1 that have been designated by plaintiffs. While Wyeth is correct that plaintiffs have satisfied this Court's order with regard to designating a representative for Subclass 1, Wyeth has taken every opportunity to challenge the propriety of this Court's 9-month old class certification order. Indeed, Wyeth has previously challenged other class representatives proffered by

plaintiffs earlier in this litigation. Based on Wyeth's anticipated vigorous opposition to the subclass representatives plaintiffs proffered on March 4, 2005, it is in the best interest of the Class – and consistent with Class Counsel's duty to the Class – to allow Ms. Berg to participate in this case.

WHEREFORE Plaintiffs respectfully request leave to add Dorothy Berg as an additional representative for Subclass 1, and all other relief that this Court deems just and proper.

Respectfully submitted, Dated: March 16, 2005

> \ Joseph E. Conley, Jr.\_ One of Plaintiffs' attorneys

Janet G. Abaray LOPEZ, HODES, RESTAINO MILMAN, SKIKOS & POLOS 312 Walnut Street, Suite 2090 Cincinnati, OH 45202 (513) 852-5600

Joseph E. Conley, Jr. **BUECHEL & CONLEY** 25 Crestview Hills Mall Road Suite 104 Crestview Hills, KY 41017 (859) 578-6600

## Co-Liaison Counsel for End-Payor Plaintiffs

Kenneth A. Wexler Jennifer Fountain Connolly THE WEXLER FIRM LLP One North LaSalle, Suite 2000 Chicago, IL 60602 (312) 346-2222

Marc H. Edelson **HOFFMAN & EDELSON** 45 West Court Street Doylestown, PA 18901 (215) 230-8043

Alan I. Gilbert Susan E. MacMenamin Barbara J. Felt HEINS MILLS & OLSON, P.C. 3550 IDS Center, 80 South Eighth Street Minneapolis, MN 55401 (612) 338-4605

Patrick E. Cafferty MILLER FAUCHER and CAFFERTY LLP 101 N. Main Street, Suite 450 Ann Arbor, MI 48104 (734) 769-2144

Steve W. Berman Craig R. Spiegel HAGENS BERMAN SOBOL SHAPIRO LLP 1301 5<sup>TH</sup> Avenue, Suite 2900 Seattle, WA 98101

Co-Lead Counsel for End-Payor Plaintiffs

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned, an attorney, hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing has been served electronically this 16<sup>th</sup> day of March 2005 on all Counsel of Record with the CM/ECF Registration and by facsimile and overnight delivery on the following:

Dan K. Webb, Esq. W. Gordon Dobie, Esq. WINSTON & STRAWN LLP 35 West Wacker Drive Chicago, IL 60601-9703

Steve D. Shadowen, Esq. Gordon A. Einhorn, Esq. HANGLEY ARONCHICK SEAGAL & **PUDLIN** 30 North Third St., Suite 700 Harrisburg, PA 17101-1810

Ruthanne Gordon BERGER & MONTAGUE, P.C. 1622 Locust Street Philadelphia, PA 19103

Eliot Long, Esq. **BUCHANAN INGERSOL** 1835 Market Street, 14th Floor Philadelphia, PA 19103

Thomas L. Long, Esq. BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP Capitol Square, Suite 2100 65 East State Street Columbus, OH 43215

\ Joseph E. Conley, Jr.\_